



Decision Making

*for Outsourcing and
Privatization of Vehicle
and Equipment Fleet
Maintenance*

March 2012

AMERICAN ASSOCIATION OF
STATE HIGHWAY AND
TRANSPORTATION OFFICIALS
AASHTO
THE VOICE OF TRANSPORTATION

EXECUTIVE COMMITTEE 2011–2012

Voting Members

Officers:

President: Kirk T. Steudle, P.E., Michigan

Vice President: Michael P. Lewis, Rhode Island

Secretary-Treasurer: Carlos Braceras, Utah

Regional Representatives:

REGION I:

Beverley Swaim-Staley, Maryland, One-Year Term

James P. Redeker, Connecticut, Two-Year Term

REGION II:

Robert St. Onge, South Carolina, One-Year Term

Eugene Conti, North Carolina, Two-Year Term

REGION III:

Kevin Keith, Missouri, One-Year Term

Mark Gottlieb, Wisconsin, Two-Year Term

REGION IV:

Francis Ziegler, North Dakota, One-Year Term

John Cox, Wyoming, Two-Year Term

Non-Voting Members

Immediate Past President: Susan Martinovich, Nevada

AASHTO Executive Director: John Horsley, Washington, DC

SUBCOMMITTEE ON MAINTENANCE 2011–2012

Chair: Carlos Braceras, Utah

Vice Chair: Jennifer Brandenburg, North Carolina

Vice Chair: Robert “Chris” Christopher, Washington

Secretary: Bryan Cawley, FHWA

Liaison: Lacy Love, AASHTO

STATE MEMBERS

ALABAMA	G. Mike Harper George H. Conner Ronald D. Pruitt	MICHIGAN	Mark Geib Steve Cook
ALASKA	Michael Coffey	MINNESOTA	Steven M. Lund Susan J. Lodahl
ARIZONA	Lonnie D. Hendrix Marwan Aouad Dennis G. Halachoff	MISSISSIPPI	Celina Sumrall
ARKANSAS	Tony Sullivan Emanuel Banks	MISSOURI	Don Hillis Elizabeth (Beth) Wright
CALIFORNIA	Tony Tavares	MONTANA	Jon Swartz
COLORADO	David C. Wieder Steve Olson	NEBRASKA	Michael T. Mattison Craig R. Lind
CONNECTICUT	Robert P. Mongillo	NEVADA	Richard J. Nelson Anita Bush
DELAWARE	Alastair Probert	NEW HAMPSHIRE	Caleb B. Dobbins Douglas Gosling
DISTRICT OF COLUMBIA	Mesfin Lakew Aaron Horton	NEW JERSEY	William Carter
FLORIDA	Tim Lattner	NEW MEXICO	Dennis Ortiz
GEORGIA	Eric Pitts Rachel Brown	NEW YORK	Peter Weykamp
HAWAII	John Williams	NORTH CAROLINA	Jennifer P. Brandenburg
IDAHO	Steve Spoor	NORTH DAKOTA	Brad Darr
ILLINOIS	Aaron Weatherholt David B. Johnson	OHIO	David Ray Halle Jones Capers
INDIANA	Jason Jones	OKLAHOMA	Kevin S. Bloss Tom Wadley
IOWA	Bob Younie	OREGON	Lucinda M. Moore
KANSAS	Peter Carttar Tim D. Cunningham	PENNSYLVANIA	W. James Smith Charles C. Goodhart
KENTUCKY	Nancy B. Albright Edward Merryman Jon Wilcoxon	RHODE ISLAND	Paul R. Annarummo
LOUISIANA	Leslie W. Mix Janice P. Williams William Drake Jr.	SOUTH CAROLINA	James J. Feda David B. Cook
MAINE	Dale Doughty	SOUTH DAKOTA	Ed Rodgers Jason Humphrey
MARYLAND	Russell A. Yurek Leonard Schultz	TENNESSEE	Mike Doran Greg Duncan Chris Harris
MASSACHUSETTS	Ron Dionne	TEXAS	Toribio Garza
		UTAH	Carlos Braceras Steven J. McCarthy Kevin Griffin Lloyd Neeley

VERMONT	Scott A. Rogers Wayne Gammell Ken Valentine	U.S DOT MEMBER	
VIRGINIA	Erle W. Potter Emmett Heltzel Jeffrey Milton		FHWA
WASHINGTON	Robert “Chris” Christopher		Christopher Newman
WEST VIRGINIA	Steven B. Cole		Paul Pisano
WISCONSIN	David I. Vieth Thomas R. Lorfeld Mark Woltmann		William Beatty
WYOMING	Kent Ketterling		Steve Mueller
			James Stevenson
			Anwar Ahmad

NCHRP PROJECT 13-03A PANEL *FIELD OF MAINTENANCE—AREA OF EQUIPMENT*

Erle Potter, <i>Chair</i> Virginia DOT, Richmond, VA	Steven McCarthy Utah DOT, Salt Lake City, UT
Joseph L. Darling Niskayuna, NY (formerly with NY State DOT)	John F. White South Carolina DOT, Columbia, SC
Dan Guy Maryland State Highway Administ., Hanover, MD	Celso Gatchalian FHWA Liaison
Sharon E. Holmes Centurion Consultant Group, Inc., Tallahassee, FL	Frank N. Lisle TRB Liaison
Donald J. Lewis Texas DOT, Austin, TX	Amir N. Hanna NCHRP Senior Program Officer

EQUIPMENT TECHNICAL WORKING GROUP 2011–2012

Erle Potter, Virginia DOT, Chair	Dennis Halachoff, Arizona DOT
Steven McCarthy, Utah DOT, Vice Chair	Timothy Cunningham, Kansas DOT
Ronald Pruitt, Alabama DOT, Vice Chair	W. James Smith, Pennsylvania DOT
	Ken Valentine, Vermont AOT

PREFACE

The outsourcing and/or privatization vehicle and equipment fleet maintenance has been a concern of many agencies and, over the years, has resulted in a variety of applications and outcomes of these endeavors.

As a result, NCHRP Project 13-03 and Project 13-03A were funded to develop a recommended set of guidelines for making decisions on outsourcing and privatization of vehicle and equipment fleet maintenance. The basic results of the studies have been reviewed and the recommended process has been approved by AASHTO for consideration as a guide for use by the member departments.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

1.0 INTRODUCTION	1-1
1.1 Study Context	1-1
1.2 Study Scope and Objectives	1-2
1.3 Purpose and Organization of This Report	1-3
2.0 BACKGROUND	2-1
2.1 Characteristics of State DOT Vehicle and Equipment Fleets	2-1
2.2 Challenges for Outsourcing Fleet Maintenance Operations	2-2
2.3 Applicable Forms of Fleet Maintenance Outsourcing	2-4
3.0 SCOPE OF THE OUTSOURCING DECISION FRAMEWORK	3-1
3.1 Purpose and Goal	3-1
3.2 Outsourcing Decision Framework Requirements	3-1
3.3 Key Factors to Be Considered	3-2
3.4 Implementation of the Framework	3-3
4.0 FLEET OUTSOURCING DECISION FRAMEWORK	4-1
4.1 Equipment Class	4-1
4.2 Maintenance Types	4-2
4.3 Outsourcing Decision Variables	4-3
4.4 Performance Measurement	4-4
4.4.1 Data or Information to Manage Fleet and Equipment Maintenance Performance	4-4
4.4.2 Key Performance Indicators or Metrics to Monitor Performance	4-5
4.4.3 Benchmarking to Gauge Performance	4-6
4.5 Modeling a Full Range of Outsourcing Alternatives	4-6
4.6 High-Level Decision-Making Process	4-7
4.7 Outsourcing Decision Subprocesses	4-8
4.7.1 Process 1: Identify Critical Internal and External Conditions	4-8
4.7.2 Process 2: Analyze Internal Demand and Capabilities	4-12
4.7.3 Process 3: Evaluate External Service Providers	4-16
4.7.4 Process 4: Analyze Cost and Performance Trade-Offs	4-18
4.7.5 Process 5: Synthesize and Finalize Outsourcing Decisions	4-26

5.0 CASE STUDIES	5-1
5.1 Case Study Context	5-2
5.2 Case Study A—Strategic Outsourcing Decision	5-3
5.2.1 Process 1: Identify Critical Internal and External Conditions	5-3
5.2.2 Process 2: Analyze Internal Demand and Capabilities	5-6
5.2.3 Process 3: Evaluate External Service Providers	5-10
5.2.4 Process 4: Analyze Cost and Performance Trade-Offs	5-11
5.2.5 Process 5: Synthesize and Finalize Outsourcing Decisions	5-15
5.3 Case Study B—Day-to-Day Outsourcing Scenario	5-15
5.3.1 Process 1: Identify Critical Internal and External Conditions	5-16
5.3.2 Process 2: Analyze Internal Demand and Capabilities	5-16
5.3.3 Process 3: Evaluate External Service Providers	5-17
5.3.4 Process 4: Analyze Cost and Performance Trade-Offs	5-17
5.3.5 Process 5: Synthesize and Finalize Outsourcing Decisions	5-18
 6.0 CONCLUSION	 6-1
 REFERENCES	 R-1
 APPENDICES	 A-1
Appendix A—Summary of Outsourcing Model and Process Steps	A-1
Appendix B—Forms and Templates	B-1